

**MINUTES OF THE
LOUISIANA ENGINEERS SELECTION BOARD
December 5, 2017**

A meeting of the Louisiana Engineers Selection Board (LESB) was held in the Claiborne Building, 1201 North Third Street, Room 1-153, Baton Rouge, Louisiana on Tuesday, December 5, 2017.

The meeting was called to order at 11:02 a.m. by Mr. Ali Mustapha, Chairman. Those members present were: Mr. Ali Mustapha, Mr. Lloyd Hoover, Mr. Bren Kramer, Mr. Jim Ferguson and (sitting as proxy for Mr. Mark Moses) Mr. John Hodnett. Ms. Candice Rodgers Hillman, Attorney General’s office as Legal Counsel, was present.

The first item of business was the approval of the September 27, 2017 minutes. Mr. Hoover made a motion to adopt the minutes; it was seconded by Mr. Ferguson. With no opposition, the motion was adopted.

The next item of business was to ask for public comment or question on any of the Agenda items. There was none.

The next item of business was to discuss any new business on any of the Agenda items. There was none.

The next item of business was the selection of designers.

ITEM #1: New Generator, Northeast Louisiana War Veterans Home, Monroe, Louisiana; Project No. 03-132-17-01; WBS F.03000018; Mr. Timothy Alsobrooks gave a brief scope of the project. Votes were recorded as follows:

Project # 1 Firm	Nomination Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
G – Purtle & Associates, LC	1	1	3	1		3
F – Aillet, Fenner, Jolly & McClelland, Inc.		3	1		1	2
C – Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC	3			2	3	1
A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.	2	2	2	3	2	

Firm G – 9 Firm F – 7 Firm C – 9 Firm A – 11

2nd Place Tie Breaker ballot between Firm G and Firm C

Project # 1 Firm	2 nd Place Tie Breaker Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
G – Purtle & Associates, LC		1	1			
C – Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC	1			1	1	1

Firm G – 2 Firm C – 4

The Firm of Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC was selected by written majority vote to move onto the Final ballot.

Final ballot between Firm A and Firm C

Project # 1 Firm	Final Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.		1	1	1		
C – Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC	1				1	1

Firm A – 3 Firm C – 3

Final Tie Breaker #1 ballot between Firm A and Firm C

Project # 1 Firm	Final Tie Breaker #1 Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.		1	1	1		
C – Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC	1				1	1

Firm A – 3 Firm C – 3

Final Tie Breaker #2 ballot between Firm A and Firm C

Project # 1 Firm	Final Tie Breaker #2 Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
A – John J. Guth Associates, Inc.		1	1	1		1
C – Craig Hebert Engineering, LLC	1				1	

Firm A – 4 Firm C – 2

The Firm of John J. Guth Associates, Inc. was selected by written majority vote.

ITEM #2: Replace Attic & Hallway HVAC Units, Southwest Louisiana War Veterans Home, Jennings, Louisiana; Project No. 03-134-17-02; WBS F.03000015; Mr. Harry Navarre gave a brief scope of the project. Votes were recorded as follows:

Project # 2 Firm	Nomination Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
C – Associated Design Group, Inc.	3	1	3		2	3
A – Assaf, Simoneaux, Tauzin & Associates, Inc.				1		2
D – Ritter Consulting Engineers, Ltd.	1	2	2	2	1	1
B – M & E Consulting, Inc.	2	3	1	3	3	

Firm C – 12 Firm A – 3 Firm D – 9 Firm B – 12

Final ballot between Firm C and Firm B

Project # 2 Firm	Final Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
C – Associated Design Group, Inc.	1		1			1
B – M & E Consulting, Inc.		1		1	1	

Firm C – 3 Firm B – 3

Final Tie Breaker #1 ballot between Firm C and Firm B

Project # 2 Firm	Final Tie Breaker #1 Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
C – Associated Design Group, Inc.	1		1	1	1	1
B – M & E Consulting, Inc.		1				

Firm C – 5 Firm B – 1

The Firm of Associated Design Group, Inc. was selected by written majority vote.

ITEM #3: Site Improvements, Bussey Brake Lake, Bastrop, Louisiana; Project No. 16-514-15-01, Part 01; WBS F.16000145; Mr. Robert Arnold gave a brief scope of the project. Votes were recorded as follows:

Project # 3 Firm	Nomination Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
A – Denmon Engineering	3	3	3	2	2	3
E – Aillet, Fenner, Jolly & McClelland, Inc.	2	1	2			2
B – Cothren, Graff, Smoak Engineering, Inc.	1		1	3	3	1
D – Royal Engineers & Consultants, LLC		2		1	1	

Firm A – 16 Firm E – 7 Firm B – 9 Firm D – 4

Project # 3 Firm	Final Ballot					
	Hodnett	Mustapha	Hoover	Ferguson	Kramer	User
A – Denmon Engineering	1	1	1		1	1
B – Cothren, Graff, Smoak Engineering, Inc.				1		

Firm A – 5 Firm B – 1

The Firm of Denmon Engineering was selected by written majority vote.

There being no further business, Mr. Hoover made a motion to adjourn the meeting. It was seconded by Mr. Hodnett. There being no opposition, the meeting was adjourned at 11:28 a.m.